City of reensboro

Date:

June 25, 2007

To:

Mitchell Johnson, City Manager

From:

Internal Audit Division

Subject:

Greensboro Education and Program Improvement Review

The Internal Audit Division has performed a review of The Greensboro Education and Program Improvement program. Attached you will find our review report; the departmental response; and our replies to their responses. We feel that our recommendations have been sufficiently addressed as we move forward. If you have any questions or need additional information, please let us know. Thanks.

Len Lucas

Internal Audit Director

Cc: Ben Brown, Assistant City Manager for Economic Development

Bob Morgan, Assistant City Manager

Dick Hails, Planning Director

City of reensboro

Date:

June 19, 2007

то:

Dick Hails, Director of Planning

From:

Internal Audit

Subject:

Federal Grant - Greensboro Education and Program Improvement: \$9,306 Grant,

\$9,306 In-Kind Match

One of the greatest challenges in Greensboro was raising the level of awareness of the urban forestry program to Greensboro citizens and improving their level of education about trees. The goals of the Greensboro Education and Program Improvement program were to: (1) raise the public's awareness of the importance of urban forestry and the Greensboro urban forestry program, and (2) promote the Neighbor Woods tree planting program initiated in 2004.

Project costs were budgeted at \$20,106. In 2005, the City was awarded a \$9,306 Federal reimbursement grant through the North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources (NCDENR) to focus on continuing education and program improvement of the Greensboro Urban Forestry Program. As a condition of grant funding, the City was required to provide a \$9,306 in-kind match. Grant funds were designated for:

- printing of tree preservation awards,
- creating an urban forestry display banner,
- purchasing books for donation to the Kathleen Clay Edwards Family Branch Library,
- purchasing a quarter page anti-tree ad in the phone book.
- purchasing of trees for the NeighborWoods tree planting program, and
- purchasing of shovels for the NeighborWoods program.

The initial grant period was September 1, 2005 through October 31, 2006, but was extended to December 31, 2006 at the request of the grantee. Actual project costs totaled \$30,264.60, but reported project costs for the General Ledger account (220-2055-01) totaled \$19,719.62: \$8,919.62 from grant reimbursements and \$10,800.00 from City in-kind match. The State recorded project costs as \$26,526.90.

The Internal Audit Division reviewed the written contract between the City and NCDENR. Our objective was to determine whether the Planning Department complied with the terms and conditions of the contract. During our review, we noted the following findings and offer our recommendations:

IN-KIND MATCH GUIDELINES

This project included two (2) neighborhood tree planting events: Glenwood and Westerwood neighborhoods. Over 300 individuals from area groups and organizations volunteer their time towards the plantings, which provided the City's in-kind match. On the day of each event, volunteers were required to complete a Volunteer Agreement Form, which outlined rules and requirements for participation as well as served as an attendance record. Volunteers under age 18 (minors) were required to obtain parental consent prior to engaging in tree planting activities.

The Contract Agreement stated that labor costs for adult volunteers should be calculated at a maximum of \$15 per hour; and youth volunteers at the maximum rate of \$5.15 per hour (or current Federal minimum wage). Also, personnel/staff pay should be calculated using (City) hourly wage rates, including fringe benefits. The City recorded \$10,800 as its in-kind match.

Finding: We reviewed the "Expense or Match Documentation" form and supporting documentation submitted to the granting agency (to report the in-kind match) for both tree plantings. All volunteers' hours were charged at the adult rate of \$15 per hour. However, in reviewing the Volunteer Agreement Forms, we noted where at least 29 minors participated in the Westerwood tree planting and at least 19 minors participated in the Greenwood tree planting. We saw evidence where the State adjusted the in-kind match amount accordingly regarding the Westerwood tree planting, but no adjustments was made to the in-kind amount regarding Glenwood.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend the Grant Administrator thoroughly review grant guidelines/requirements prior to submitting any documentation to the granting agency.

REPORTS/REQUEST FOR REIMBURSEMENT

The contract stated there were two accomplishment reports required: a Mid-Year Status Report (due April 30, 2006) and a Final Accomplishment Report (due by the contract end date). Also, up to four Requests for Reimbursement forms could be completed to claim grant funds during the contract period.

<u>Finding</u>: There was no indication (in the grant files) that a Mid-Year Status Report was completed or submitted to the granting agency. Also, it was noted that \$5,035.80 in expenditures were made towards the project in October/November 2005. However, a Request for Reimbursement was not submitted until August 2006. Grant funds were received from the State and deposited in September 2006.

<u>Recommendation</u>: The Grant Administrator should ensure that all required reporting is completed and submitted to the granting agency in accordance with the written agreement.

We would like to thank the Planning Department for the courtesy and cooperation shown us during this review. If you have any questions or concerns, please contact us at 373-4528.

Tina McKoy

Internal Auditor II

Len Lucas

Internal Audit Director

Cc: Ben Brown, Assistant City Manager for Economic Development Bob Morgan, Assistant City Manager

McKoy, Tina W

From:

Hails, Dick

Sent:

Tuesday, June 19, 2007 9:38 PM

To:

McKoy, Tina W

Cc:

Cusimano, Mike; MacIntosh, Alec

Subject: RE: NCDEHNR Grant - "Greensboro Education and Program Improvement - 2005-06; \$9,306

Thanks, Tina.

I have no problems with the findings.

As with our response to the last grant that didn't have close enough supervision, we will be relying on monthly contract monitoring meetings with Mike Cusimano as lead staff, along with his supervisor, Alec MacIntosh. They will review all grant actions, deadlines, documentation, acknowledgements and related grant requirements. I will ask them to submit to me a brief monthly report on their findings.

Thank you for your assistance, Dick

Richard W. Hails, AICP

Planning Director City of Greensboro 300 Washington Street P.O. Box 3136 Greensboro, NC 27402-3136

W: 336-373-2922 F: 336-412-6315

E: dick.hails@greensboro-nc.gov

From: McKoy, Tina W

Sent: Tuesday, June 19, 2007 11:53 AM

To: Hails, Dick Cc: Lucas, Len

Subject: RE: NCDEHNR Grant - "Greensboro Education and Program Improvement - 2005-06; \$9,306

Dick-

If you are in agreement, I will release the final written report to the Manager's Office today. You will still have time to coordinate your response. Please let me know ASAP whether or not you concur.

Thanks.

Tina W. McKoy Internal Audit 373-4528

From: Hails, Dick

Sent: Monday, June 04, 2007 8:57 PM

To: McKoy, Tina W

Subject: RE: NCDEHNR Grant - "Greensboro Education and Program Improvement - 2005-06; \$9,306

Tina:

I have been out of the office for almost 3 weeks. I am just now catching up on my emails.

I plan to send you a response later this week. I have met with our staff involved to coordinate a response.

Sorry for the delay,

Dick

Richard W. Hails, AICP

Planning Director City of Greensboro 300 Washington Street P.O. Box 3136 Greensboro, NC 27402-3136 W: 336-373-2922

F: 336-412-6315

E: dick.hails@greensboro-nc.gov

From: McKoy, Tina W

Sent: Wednesday, May 16, 2007 1:31 PM

To: Hails, Dick Cc: Lucas, Len

Subject: FW: NCDEHNR Grant - "Greensboro Education and Program Improvement - 2005-06; \$9,306

Dick,

What is your status in reviewing this report?

Tîna W. McKoy Internal Audit 373-4528

From: McKoy, Tina W

Sent: Wednesday, May 09, 2007 11:15 AM

To: Hails, Dick Cc: Lucas, Len

Subject: NCDEHNR Grant - "Greensboro Education and Program Improvement - 2005-06; \$9,306

Hi Dick,

Attached is a draft review report for the above mentioned grant. Please read it and let me know whether or not you concur with its findings and recommendations. Upon your agreement with the report's contents, a final report will be mailed, and you will have 14 days from that date to respond with corrective action to be taken.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to call me at the number below. Thank you, and as always, it is a pleasure to work with you!

Tina W. McKoy Internal Auditor II City of Greensboro Internal Audit Division

City of reensboro

Date:

June 20, 2007

To:

Dick Hails, Director of Planning

From:

Internal Audit

Subject:

2005 NCDENR Grant (Greensboro Education and Program Improvement) –

Reply to Response dated June 19, 2007

The Internal Audit Division has reviewed your response to our review of the Greensboro Education and Program Improvement grant, and we agree with your departmental responses to our recommendations.

If you have any questions or concerns, please do not hesitate to contact us at 373-4528.

Tina McKoy

Internal Auditor II

Tha mcka

Len Lucas

Internal Audit Director

Cc:

Ben Brown, Assistant City Manager for Economic Development

Bob Morgan, Assistant City Manager