

Date:

February 11, 2008

To:

Mitchell Johnson, City Manager

From:

Internal Audit Division

Subject:

Greenbriar Housing, L.L.C. (Partnership Village I)

The Internal Audit Division has completed our annual review of Partnership Village I in conjunction with a Programmatic Review by the Housing & Community Development Department for the 2005-2006 grant year. Attached you will find our review report; the programmatic report; the agency response; the departmental response and our replies to their responses. We feel that sufficient corrective actions have been implemented to our recommendations as we move forward. If you have any questions or need additional information, please let us know. Thanks.

Len Lucas

Internal Audit Director

Cc: Bob Morgan, Assistant City Manager

Andy Scott, Director of Housing & Community Development



Date:

November 1, 2007

To:

Andy Scott, Director of Housing & Community Development

From:

Internal Audit Division

Subject:

Greenbriar Housing, LLC (Partnership Village I) 2005-2006

The Internal Audit Division has performed our compliance review of the year ended December 31, 2006 of Greenbriar Housing, LLC, which consists of 32 units for low-income homeless individuals located at 131 to 133 Greenbriar Road. The tenants can only stay a maximum of two years and then move finding permanent housing.

This Limited Liability Corporation received a loan in February 19, 1999 for \$289,000 from the City of Greensboro to help in the initial building of the apartment units. This is a non-interest bearing loan with final payment due March 1, 2030. The current balance per the department of Housing & Community Development is \$288,145. Principal payments were to begin March 1, 2001 at 50% of gross receipts after deducting all normal and reasonable operating and capital expenses actually incurred and payments into the Replacement Reserve Account. There was no payment due for year ended December 31, 2006. These studio units are called the Partnership Village I and are managed by Partnership Property Management.

We were not accompanied by the building inspectors from the Department of Housing & Community Development (HCD). The inspectors will inspect approximately 15 percent of the units at a later date and a written report of their findings will be forwarded to the Property Management. As of the date of the report Internal Audit has not received the inspection report from HCD.

We examined selected financial transactions maintained by the entity for compliance with the loan agreement. Based on our review, it appears that the funds have been spent according to the terms of the loan agreement except for the following findings:

#### FINDING:

The Management Letter for fiscal year ended December 31, 2006 was due to the City within 180 days of the fiscal year end or by June 29, 2007. We did not receive this document until October 3, 2007.

#### RECOMMENDATION:

The Partnership should deliver to the City the Management Letter by the date required in the loan agreement.

We request a written signed response from Partnership Property Management which should be received by November 15, 2007 with a copy to the Department of Housing & Community Development (HCD) and the Internal Audit Division.

We also request a written signed response from HCD on this review which should be received on or before November 15, 2007.

We would like to thank Ms. Pat Somers, Associate Property Manager; Mr. Harry Lee, Site Manager; Ms. Sandy Lucas, Director – Asset Management and the staff of Partnership Property Management for their courtesy and cooperation shown to us during this visit. If there are any questions or comments concerning the details of this visit, we can be reached at 373-2821.

Mickey Kerans Internal Auditor

Len Lucas Internal Audit Director

Cc: Ben Brown, Assistant City Manager for Economic Development Bob Kelly, President of Partnership Homes, Incorporated



Date:

October 31, 2007

To:

Greenbriar Housing, LLC

From:

Michael Blair, City of Greensboro HCD

RE:

FY07/08 Partnership Village I Programmatic Evaluation

On October 10, 2007 HCD and Internal Audit (IA) staff conducted an on-site monitoring visit of the Partnership Village I Apartments. The property is located at 131 – 133 Greenbriar Road in Greensboro, NC. Partnership Property Management, Inc. (Formally Harris-Brown Management) manages the property and in this capacity is responsible to the City of Greensboro Department of Housing and Community Development for contractual compliance.

The purpose of the monitoring visit is to determine whether the property is meeting applicable and contractual requirements. In this monitoring review attention was paid to contract compliance along with financial management systems, a review of tenant files, and occupancy.

The period under review, along with current conditions, was from July 1, 2006 to June 30, 2007. In addition to examining various program materials, a physical inspection and financial files, in the course of the review HCD and IA staff met with Ms. Pat Somers, Associate Property Manager; Mr. Harry Lee, Site Manager and Ms. Sandy Lucas, Director.

The February 1999 project created 32 studio units for low-income residents. It is a two year Transitional Housing property for the homeless. No Greensboro Consortium HOME Program funds were expended on these properties therefore the NCHFA/LIHTC guidelines regarding occupancy and tenancy requirements are used for this review along with city loan agreement requirements. Affordability was to be for 18 years.

City of Greensboro financing for Partnership Village I consisted of \$289,000 in local funds combined with \$1,211,000 in private funding as well as North Carolina Affordable Housing Tax Credits.

The thirty-two (32) studio units at Partnership Village I are required to be made affordable to, and occupied by, families (individuals) with income (adjusted) at or less than 45% of Median income adjusted for family size (studio units).

One (1) person 100% median income is \$39,480; adjusted to 45% it is \$17,766 (rounded to the nearest \$50) or \$17,750. Only two tenants have exceeded 45% of median income, none have exceeded 140% per the RCRS.

2007 rent at 45% of affordability for a studio unit:  $$17,750 / 12 = $1,479 \times .30 = $444/month$ 

This has been met with tenant rents at \$385/month (plus utilities \$34/m). HCD has determined that the utility allowance provided by Duke Energy will serve as the utility cost per unit. This is derived from the average of 3 units provided by Duke Energy or \$34/month. This utility average

is not included on the RCRS report or reflected in tenant files. HCD staff does not consider this a concern only an observation and potentially confusing condition. Unless prohibited by the NCHFA the utility adjustment for this property should be \$34/m and not \$76/m which is what was found in the tenant file documentation.

Incomes of residents are certified annually according to the NCFHA report dated from 09.26.07. Eight (8) tenant files were inspected by HCD staff. The files were well maintained and contained all required income and lease information.

The reported occupancy has been 93.9% from January 2007 through September 2007. This is better than the April 2007 area occupancy rate of around 89.1%.

Section 8 tenants are accepted and occupy only one (1) unit. This is likely due to the local rental subsidy given to all residents and the nature of a two year transitional property.

Partnership Property Management has a fair marketing plan that meets the City Affirmative Marketing Requirements. The Tenant Selection Policy is clear and understandable.

Management maintains an updated waiting list with approximately seventy-two (72) current applicants at the time of the visit.

The HCD staff inspector staff was not available on September 27, 2007 and will perform an inspection at a later date.

As a result of this review HCD staff is making one (1) finding and zero (0) concerns. A *finding* is defined by HCD as a project element that does not comply with a local, federal, or contractual, rule or regulation whereas a *concern* is either a potential finding or management weakness that should be improved to avoid future problems.

### Finding - Audit

City of Greensboro Internal Audit staff reports that the management letter was submitted on October 3, 2007. The independent external audit was submitted on March 1, 2007 which is commendable however the management letter was not part of that submittal.

The financial statement, which includes a management letter or letter stating no management concern by the CPA, is due per the agreement §5.4 within 180 days of the fiscal year end (FYE), delivery was 272 days from FYE.

## Requested Action

Management should submit to the City the management letter along with the external audit within 180 days of fiscal year end per the agreement.

HCD staff requests that management review the Internal Audit report and reply to it as requested. The draft Internal Audit report is dated October 9, 2007.

The finding in this review, in our view, does not reflect negatively on property management staff and their work ensuring continued affordability compliance. The intent of the finding is to ensure future contractual compliance regarding complete submittal of financial statements.

It is HCD staff opinion that Partnership Village I Apartments is contractually compliant concerning affordability requirements. The property itself appears to be in good condition and remains a good transitional housing option for qualified recently homeless households.

HCD staff appreciates the assistance provided during the monitoring visit by Partnership Property Management staff.

Michael Blair

Specialist Grant Compliance

Andy Scott

Director HCD



## **MEMO**

Date:

November 6, 2007

∬Jo: ∭ From: Len Lucas, Internal Audit Director

Michael Blair, Specialist Grants Compliance

RF:

2007 HCD Review of Partnership Village I Audit Report

HCD has reviewed the draft October 9, 2007 Internal Audit report on Partnership Village I. The audit is for 2005-2006. HCD submits the following:

## IA Finding 1:

The Management Letter for fiscal year ended December 31, 2006 was due to the City within 90 days of the fiscal year end or by March 30, 2007. We did not receive this document until October 3, 2007.

## **IA Recommendation 1:**

The Partnership should deliver to the City the Management Letter by the date required in the loan agreement.

#### HCD Reply to Finding/Recommendation 1: Concur.

Note: The February 1999 agreement is set at 180 days from fiscal-year-end not 90 days. This would have made it due June 30, 2006 which is still prior to November 28, 2006. This was included as a finding in the HCD programmatic review.

#### IA Finding 2:

The report dated March 9, 2007 prepared by the North Carolina Housing Finance Agency required a written response from Partnership Housing, Internal Audit has requested at copy of the Partnership's reply but as of the date of this report we have not received subject reply.

#### IA Recommendation 2:

The Partnership should comply with the City's request.

HCD Reply to Finding/Recommendation 2: Concur.

Summary: HCD generally concurs with the Internal Audit report.



November 8, 2007

Date:

Andy Scott, Director of Housing & Community Development

To:

Internal Audit Division

From:

HCD Reply to IA Report-Partnership Village I 2005-2006

Subject:

Thank you for your reply of November 1, 2007. Internal Audit agrees with Housing & Community Development's response to IA' subject report dated December 18, 2006 that the financials per the contract were due within 180 days. We also agree with you that Management should send the City copies of their reply to the North Carolina Housing Finance Agency's report dated March 9, 2007.

Mickey Kerans Internal Auditor Len Lucas

Internal Audit Director

Cc: Ben Brown, Assistant City Manager for Economic Development

Kerans, Mickey

From: Kerans, Mickey

Sent: Wednesday, December 19, 2007 1:21 PM

To: 'psomers@partnershippm.com'

Cc: Blair, Michael; 'hlee@partnershippm.com'

Subject: Review Partnership Village I & II





Partnnership Vllg. I Partnnership Vllg. II Apts 05-0... Apts 05-...

We mailed the reviews (see attached) to Bob Kelly on November 1, 2007. His reply was due to us by November 15, 2007. As of today we have not received Mr. Kelly's written reply. Would you please contact Mr. Kelly and advise him of the situation.

Thanks, MK

Mickey Kerans, Internal Auditor City of Greensboro P. O. Box 3136 Greensboro, NC 27401

Ph: 336-373-2821 Fx: 336-373-2138 Kerans, Mickey

From: Kerans, Mickey

Sent: Monday, January 14, 2008 7:56 AM

To: 'hlee@partnershippm.com'

Cc: Blair, Michael

Subject: FW: Review Partnership Village I & II

### Harry:

In regard to the e-mail below I sent out on 12/19/07, I haven't heard from anyone. Would you follow-up with Mr. Kelly or whoever so we can get a final resolution to matter?

Thanks,

Mickey Kerans

----Original Message-----From: Kerans, Mickey

Sent: Wednesday, December 19, 2007 1:21 PM

To: 'psomers@partnershippm.com'

Cc: Blair, Michael; 'hlee@partnershippm.com' Subject: Review Partnership Village I & II





Partnnership Vilg. I Partnnership Vilg. II Apts 05-0... Apts 05-...

We mailed the reviews (see attached) to Bob Kelly on November 1, 2007. His reply was due to us by November 15, 2007. As of today we have not received Mr. Kelly's written reply. Would you please contact Mr. Kelly and advise him of the situation.

Thanks, MK

Mickey Kerans, Internal Auditor City of Greensboro P. O. Box 3136 Greensboro, NC 27401

Ph: 336-373-2821 Fx: 336-373-2138



## CERTIFIED MAIL RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

January 28, 2008

Mr. Robert Kelly Greenbriar Housing PO Box 3402 Greensboro, NC 27402

RE: Greenbriar Housing, LLC(Partnership Village I & II) 2005-2006

Dear Mr. Kelly:

In regards to the City of Greensboro's review report dated November 1, 2007, this is to advise we have not received your response to subject report that was due to us by November 15, 2007. We followed up by e-mail with Ms. Somers of Partnership Management on December 19, 2007 and Mr. Lee of Partnership Village on January 14, 2008. As of today, we have not had a response or reply from anyone. Please see copies of correspondence enclosed.

Please send us your written response as soon as possible. If you should have any questions, please call me at 373-2821.

Sincerely,

Mickey Kerans

Internal Audit

Len Lucas

Internal Audit Director

Enclosure

Cc: Ben Brown-Assistant City Manager for Economic Development Andy Scott-Director of Housing & Community Development Winston McGregor-Executive Director of Habitat for Humanity of Greater Greensboro

# McGladrey & Pullen

**Certified Public Accountants** 

McGladrey & Pullen, LLP 230 North Elm St., Ste. 1100, Greensboro, NC 27401-2436 P.O. 8ox 2470, Greensboro, NC 27402-2470 0 336.273.4461 F 336.274.2519 www.mcgladrey.com

February 1, 2008

Mr. Mickey Kerans City of Greensboro P.O. Box 3136 Greensboro, North Carolina 27401

Dear Mr. Kerans:

This letter is to inform you that McGladrey & Pullen, LLP did not issue a management letter for Partnership Village I and II for the year ended December 31, 2006.

Sincerely,

Ed W. Evans

Cl E

Partner

## Kerans, Mickey

From:

Sandy Lucas [SLucas@partnershippm.com]

Sent:

Friday, February 01, 2008 12:37 PM

To:

Bob Kelley; Kerans, Mickey

Subject:

Management letter



Scan001.PDF (37 KB)

----Original Message-----

From: Evans, Ed [mailto:ed.evans@rsmi.com] Sent: Friday, February 01, 2008 11:35 AM

To: Sandy Lucas

Subject: FW: Scan from a Xerox WorkCentre

Hi, Sandy.

The letter is attached.

#### DISCLAIMER:

This e-mail is only intended for the person(s) to whom it is addressed and may contain confidential information. Unless stated to the contrary, any opinions or comments are personal to the writer and do not represent the official view of the company. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify us immediately by reply e-mail and then delete this message from your system. Please do not copy it or use it for any purposes, or disclose its contents to any other person. Thank you for your cooperation.

Circular 230 Disclosure: Any advice contained in this email (including any attachments unless expressly stated otherwise) is not intended or written to be used, and cannot be used, for purposes of avoiding tax penalties that may be imposed on any taxpayer.

Confidentiality Notice: The information contained in this e-mail transmittal is privileged, confidential, and intended for the exclusive use of the addressee only. If you are not the intended recipient, any use, disclosure, distribution or taking of any action in reliance on this information is strictly prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the sender of this transmittal immediately.

## City of Greensboro North Carolina

February 4, 2008

Mr. Robert G. Kelley Greenbriar Housing P. O. Box 3402 Greensboro, NC 27402

Re: Partnership Village I & II-2005 to 2006

Dear Mr. Kelley:

We are in receipt of McGladrey & Pullen's letter dated February 1, 2008 reference the City's Internal Audit report letters November 1, 2007 and November 6, 2007 for the 2005 to 2006 Year.

We have reviewed McGladrey & Pullen's Management Letter covering both properties and we agree with their response.

Sincerely,

Mickey Kerans

Internal Auditor

Len Lucas

Internal Audit Director

Cc: Mitchell Johnson, City Manager Andy Scott, Director of Housing & Community Development